The Comprehensive Guide to Deconstruction Appraisals: Understanding Valuation Methods and Industry Standards

Jessica I. Marschall, CPA, ISA AM, President The Green Mission Inc., GM-ESG, Probity Appraisal Group and MAS LLC

Jennie Lumpkin, The Green Mission Inc., GM-ESG, Probity Appraisal Group

September 25th, 2025

Introduction: The Intersection of Sustainability and Tax Policy

Deconstruction appraisals represent a unique convergence of environmental responsibility, tax strategy, and professional valuation expertise. As the construction industry grapples with its significant environmental footprint and the substantial construction and demolition (C&D) waste generated annually, the practice of systematic deconstruction coupled with donation to qualifying organizations by procuring IRS Qualified Appraisals has emerged as both an ecological imperative and a financial opportunity for property owners.

The transformation of buildings slated for demolition into carefully catalogued, valued, and donated materials offers multiple benefits: diverting waste from landfills, supporting qualified nonprofit organizations, providing valuable materials to the secondary market, and generating significant tax deductions for donors. However, the complexity of properly valuing deconstructed materials requires specialized expertise and, most importantly, needs to be tethered to accurate and credible asset values.

The Fundamental Principle: Constructive Severance and Market Reality


At the heart of deconstruction appraisals lies a critical legal and valuation concept: constructive severance. This principle establishes that the moment building materials are removed from a structure, they undergo a fundamental transformation from real property to personal property. This distinction is not merely semantic; it carries profound implications for how these materials must be valued and why accurate valuations at realistic market levels are essential for the integrity of this environmentally crucial tax deduction.

The Detachment Principle

When intact, a building's components contribute to its overall real estate value. A kitchen might add $50,000 to a home's market value when installed and functioning. However, once those same cabinets, appliances, and fixtures are carefully removed (detached from the real property) they become individual pieces of personal property that must be valued based on their actual marketability in the secondary market, not their contribution to real estate value.

This transformation explains why a 4,500 square foot home in Vienna, Virginia with an improvement value of $500,000 might yield only $100,000 in deconstructed materials suitable for donation. The appraiser must resist the temptation to assign real property improvement values to what has become, through constructive severance, distinctly different assets with their own market dynamics.

Why Accurate Valuations Matter

Setting unrealistic expectations by valuing personal property as intact real property does nothing to help the environment or bolster the secondary market for building materials. We cannot expect the IRS to accept valuations that do not align with actual market values. When appraisals reflect true market conditions, the tax deduction remains a valuable and legitimate incentive that successfully encourages environmental responsibility while maintaining integrity with tax authorities.

The Valuation Methodology: Sales Comparison Approach

The predominant method for valuing deconstructed materials is the Sales Comparison Approach, which requires appraisers to research and analyze actual sales of comparable property on the "secondary market" or the market for used building materials. This approach aligns with the IRS's requirement that donated property be valued at its Fair Market Value (FMV), defined as the price at which property would change hands between a willing buyer and willing seller, neither being under compulsion to buy or sell and both having reasonable knowledge of relevant facts.

Research Requirements

Implementing the Sales Comparison Approach for deconstructed materials demands extensive market research across multiple channels:

1. **Online Marketplaces**: Appraisers must monitor sales on platforms where used building materials trade, tracking actual transaction prices rather than listing prices.

This includes specialized architectural salvage sites, general marketplaces, and auction results.

2. **Physical Reuse Centers**: Both nonprofit and for-profit reuse yards provide critical pricing data. Appraisers must understand regional variations in demand and pricing, as markets for reclaimed materials vary significantly by geography.
3. **Specialty Markets**: Certain materials, antique barn lumber, historical architectural elements, high-end appliances, trade in specialized markets with their own pricing dynamics. Understanding these niche markets is essential for accurate valuation.

Documentation Standards

Each appraisal must include comprehensive documentation supporting the value conclusion:

- Detailed inventory of all donated materials with individual valuations
- Photographic documentation of condition and quality
- Analysis of comparable sales with adjustments for differences
- Market analysis demonstrating demand for the specific materials
- Clear explanation of the valuation methodology employed

Common Valuation Errors and Misconceptions

The deconstruction appraisal field has witnessed several recurring errors that can invalidate deductions and expose taxpayers to penalties:

Using Real Estate Values for Personal Property

Some appraisers erroneously use real estate improvement values as the basis for valuing deconstructed materials. This fundamental error ignores the principle of constructive severance and typically results in grossly inflated valuations that cannot withstand IRS scrutiny.

Inappropriate Use of Cost Approach and RS Means

While the Cost Approach (replacement cost new less depreciation) might seem logical, courts have repeatedly rejected its use for donated building materials. The Mann v. United States case specifically addressed this issue, with the court finding that using construction cost estimating software like R.S. Means to value donated materials was inappropriate.

It is crucial to understand that RS Means is designed for cost segregation analysis and new construction estimation, not for valuing used materials in the secondary market. You cannot simply use depreciated new material prices to represent secondary market values. The court emphasized that Fair Market Value must be based on actual market transactions, not theoretical replacement costs or fabricated values.

Some appraisers might be tempted by the ease of this approach; plugging numbers into RS Means and applying haphazardly applied depreciation percentages. This would take mere minutes compared to the months of research required for accurate market analysis. However, this shortcut approach fundamentally misrepresents the actual value of donated materials and undermines the credibility of the entire deduction. We would increase our margins 1000% if we could feed deconstructed materials into a plug-and-play software system. Instead, properly researching and documenting the secondary market valuation inputs takes months of combined staff time.

Including Non-Donated Materials

Appraisals must only include materials actually donated to the qualified charity. Materials destroyed during deconstruction, items retained by the property owner, or materials disposed of through other channels cannot be included in the donation value, regardless of their theoretical worth.

Failure to Account for Marketability

Not all salvaged materials have viable secondary markets. Appraisers must realistically assess whether removed materials can actually be sold or reused. Custom-sized components, outdated styles, or materials in poor condition may have minimal or no value despite their original cost or theoretical utility.

IRS Compliance Requirements

The Internal Revenue Service maintains strict standards for both appraisals and appraisers in the context of charitable contributions:

Qualified Appraiser Standards

An IRS Qualified Appraiser must meet specific educational and professional criteria:

- Hold an appraisal designation from recognized organizations (International Society of Appraisers, American Society of Appraisers, or Appraisers Association of America) OR

- Complete college or professional-level coursework in valuing the specific type of property
- Possess at least two years of experience in buying, selling, or valuing similar property
- Regularly perform appraisals for compensation as part of established business practice

Qualified Appraisal Requirements

The appraisal itself must comply with Treasury Regulation §1.170A-17(a)(3):

- Be conducted no more than 60 days before the donation date
- Follow the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP)
- Include all required elements: property description, physical condition, valuation date, FMV on contribution date, appraisal method used, and specific basis for valuation
- Not base fees on a percentage of the appraised value
- Include a declaration of the appraiser's independence

Form 8283 Compliance

Form **8283**
(Rev. December 2023)
Department of the Treasury
Internal Revenue Service

Noncash Charitable Contributions

Attach one or more Forms 8283 to your tax return if you claimed a total deduction of over $500 for all contributed property.

Go to *www.irs.gov/Form8283* for instructions and the latest information.

OMB No. 1545-0074

Attachment Sequence No. **155**

Name(s) shown on your income tax return	**Identifying number**

Enter the entity name and identifying number from the tax return where the noncash charitable contribution was originally reported, if different from above.

Name: ______ Identifying number: ______

Check this box if a family pass-through entity made the noncash charitable contribution. See instructions . . . . ☐

Note: Figure the amount of your contribution deduction before completing this form. See your tax return instructions.

For donations exceeding $5,000, proper completion of IRS Form 8283 is mandatory. This form requires signatures from both the appraiser (Part IV) and the receiving organization (Part V). Courts have shown strict compliance standards, in Loube v. Commissioner, the taxpayer lost their entire deduction simply because the appraiser failed to sign the form.

Circular 230 Standards for Appraisers

Treasury Department Circular No. 230 (Rev. 6-2014)

Catalog Number 16586R
www.irs.gov

Regulations Governing Practice before the Internal Revenue Service

Beyond Form 8283 requirements, appraisers who prepare documentation for IRS submission are subject to Treasury Circular 230, which governs practice before the Internal Revenue Service. This regulation recognizes that appraisers prepare documentation "relating to a taxpayer's rights, privileges, or liabilities under laws or regulations administered by the Internal Revenue Service," placing them under the same professional standards as attorneys, CPAs, and enrolled agents.

Under Circular 230, appraisers must meet specific eligibility requirements and are prohibited from practice if they:

- Have been convicted of any felony involving dishonesty or breach of trust
- Have been convicted of any felony under Federal tax laws
- Have been convicted of any felony for which the conduct involved renders them unfit to practice before the IRS
- Have had their professional licenses suspended or revoked for cause
- Have been disbarred or suspended from practice as an attorney, CPA, public accountant, or actuary
- Have been sanctioned under Circular 230 with current suspension or disbarment
- Have demonstrated incompetence or disreputable conduct including:
    - Providing false or misleading information to the Treasury Department
    - Willfully failing to file Federal tax returns
    - Misappropriating or failing to properly remit funds received from clients for payment of taxes
    - Directly or indirectly attempting to influence IRS employees through illegal means

    - Using false or misleading representations to procure employment to practice before the IRS

These standards underscore that preparing appraisals for tax deductions is not merely a business transaction, it is a professional practice with serious ethical and legal obligations. Taxpayers should verify that their appraiser is not only technically qualified but also meets these character and fitness standards, as violations can result in rejected appraisals and lost deductions.

The Secondary Market Dynamics

Understanding the secondary market for building materials is crucial for accurate valuation. This market operates differently from new construction materials markets:

Regional Variations

Demand for reclaimed materials varies significantly by region. Urban areas with strong historic preservation movements often show significant demand for architectural salvage. Rural areas might have stronger markets for reclaimed barn wood and agricultural building materials. Climate also affects demand as materials suitable for humid climates may have limited markets in arid regions.

Quality and Condition Factors

Unlike new materials with standardized grades, reclaimed materials require individual assessment:

- **Antique Value**: Materials over 100 years old may sell with premiums if they display desirable patina, craftsmanship, or historical significance
- **Structural Integrity**: Load-bearing timbers must retain sufficient strength for reuse
- **Dimensional Stability**: Lumber must be straight and true enough for practical reuse
- **Aesthetic Condition**: Visible materials like flooring or trim must meet aesthetic standards

Market Timing

The secondary market can be more volatile than new materials markets. Economic downturns might reduce demand for optional renovation materials while increasing interest in lower-cost reclaimed options. Conversely, trends in sustainable building can create sudden demand spikes for specific materials.

Special Considerations for Different Material Categories

Lumber and Timber

Reclaimed wood represents one of the most valuable categories in deconstruction, particularly:

- **Old-Growth Timber**: Pre-1900 lumber often contains tight growth rings and dimensions unavailable in modern lumber
- **Specialty Species**: Chestnut, heart pine, and other species no longer commercially harvested
- **Barn Wood**: Weathered siding and beams sought for aesthetic purposes

Valuation must consider species, dimensions, condition, and regional demand. Lumber requiring extensive processing (de-nailing, re-milling) must be valued accounting for these costs.

Architectural Elements

Historical architectural components, including mantels, doors, windows, and hardware, require specialized knowledge:

- **Period Authenticity**: Original Victorian, Craftsman, or other period elements command premiums
- **Completeness**: Full sets (matching doors, complete window units with hardware) value higher than incomplete assemblies
- **Provenance**: Elements from notable buildings may carry additional value

Modern Materials

Contemporary materials like kitchen cabinets, appliances, and fixtures depreciate rapidly but may retain value if:

- Recently manufactured (within 5-10 years)
- High-end brands with strong secondary demand
- Standard sizes enabling easy reuse
- Good working condition with minimal wear

The Role of Professional Organizations

The three primary personal property appraisal organizations, American Society of Appraisers, International Society of Appraisers, and Appraisers Association of America, play crucial roles in maintaining standards:

Education and Certification

These organizations provide:

- Core curriculum in appraisal methodology
- Specialized courses in personal property categories
- Testing and certification programs
- Continuing education requirements
- Ethics training and enforcement

USPAP Compliance

All three organizations require members to follow the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice, ensuring:

- Consistent methodology across appraisals
- Proper documentation standards
- Ethical behavior and independence
- Competency in specific property types

Industry Advancement

The organizations work to professionalize the field through:

- Research into valuation methodologies
- Publication of best practices
- Liaison with IRS and other regulatory bodies
- Development of specialty standards for emerging fields

However, notably absent from these organizations' current offerings is specific coursework in deconstructed building materials, a gap that highlights the specialized nature of this appraisal niche and our firms willingness to facilitate training and growth in deconstruction appraisers.

The Reality of Market Research: Why Proper Appraisals Take Time

Professional firms that take this field seriously, like ours, have been studying the secondary market across the country for years, tracking actual sales, understanding regional variations, and documenting price trends. This research cannot be shortcut or fabricated. While the secondary market remains somewhat segmented, it is expanding and bringing in more participants every year.

Six Years of Market Intelligence and Expansion

Over our six years of operation, we have developed a comprehensive internal database tracking price points and sales across the secondary market nationwide. This proprietary market intelligence represents thousands of hours of research, documenting actual transactions rather than theoretical values. Our commitment to understanding and developing this market has led to strategic expansion of our services:

- **GM ESG Solutions**: Extending our expertise to corporate decommissioning and large-scale commercial deconstruction projects
- **Probity Appraisal Group**: Handling more traditional personal property donations including fine art, antiques, and estate property
- **Secondary Market Development Consulting**: Undertaking significant consultation roles with both new and existing secondary market participants

This consulting work is particularly crucial, as we are actively helping create a more functional market where supply and demand curves can finally meet effectively. By working with reuse centers, online platforms, contractors, and material processors, we are addressing the structural barriers that have historically limited market efficiency.

Building Tomorrow's Market Today

When supply becomes more consistent and distribution channels improve, natural market forces will drive demand. This increased demand, based on real market dynamics, will result in legitimate higher price points, which will translate to higher tax deductions for donors. This is the sustainable path to value growth: building market infrastructure, improving material flows, and connecting buyers with sellers more efficiently.

However, there is no artificial shortcut to achieving these higher values. No amount of creative accounting, RS Means inapplicable usage, or theoretical depreciation schedules can substitute for actual market development. Values will increase when the market supports them, not when appraisers decide to increase them.

The Time Investment in Accuracy

A proper deconstruction appraisal takes months and requires significant staff hours. This stands in stark contrast to the five-minute exercise of plugging numbers into RS Means and applying arbitrary depreciation percentages. While some might be tempted by the prospect of charging high fees for minimal work, this approach fundamentally fails clients and undermines the environmental mission of deconstruction.

Reputable appraisers invest this time because accuracy matters. Protecting clients from IRS challenges, supporting the growth of the secondary market, and maintaining the integrity of this valuable environmental incentive all require extensive research and documentation. There are no shortcuts to establishing Fair Market Value based on actual market conditions.

Market Evolution and Future Values

As more participants enter the secondary market and infrastructure improves, we are seeing gradual value increases that reflect real supply and demand dynamics. When we achieve a more functional secondary market, with better distribution channels, standardized grading, and increased consumer awareness, values will naturally increase. Only then can property owners enjoy higher appraisal numbers, because they will actually align with market reality rather than wishful thinking.

The Core Problem: Protecting a Valuable Environmental Incentive

Deconstruction donations represent an environmentally sound tax deduction that does tremendous good for waste reduction and the secondary retail market. However, we cannot allow the pursuit of inflated values that are unsupported by actual market conditions to continue undermining this important incentive.

The Danger of Inflated Valuations

When appraisers push through values that are irrational and contrary to basic valuation methodology and theory, they create multiple problems:

1. **Unrealistic Expectations**: Property owners develop false expectations about donation values, leading to disappointment and skepticism about the entire process
2. **IRS Scrutiny**: Inflated appraisals trigger audits and challenges, potentially resulting in lost deductions, penalties, and interest
3. **Market Distortion**: Unrealistic valuations confuse market participants and hinder development of transparent pricing
4. **Reputation Damage**: The entire field suffers when inflated appraisals make headlines or result in court cases
5. **Fee Inflation**: Some companies charge higher appraisal fees based on inflated values rather than the actual work required for proper research

Conclusion: The Path Forward Through Professional Integrity

Deconstruction appraisals, when properly conducted at accurate valuation levels, provide valuable and legitimate tax deductions that successfully incentivize environmental responsibility. These deductions work in that they encourage property owners to choose deconstruction over demolition, support nonprofit organizations, and build the secondary materials market. But their continued viability depends on maintaining professional standards and market-based valuations.

The distinction between real property and personal property through constructive severance is not a technicality to be circumvented—it is a fundamental principle that ensures donated materials are valued based on their actual utility and marketability. You cannot fabricate values. You cannot use intact real property values for detached personal property. You cannot substitute RS Means calculations for actual market research.

After six years of carefully tracking secondary sales across the country, the evidence is clear: the market is real, it is growing, and it provides legitimate values that support meaningful tax deductions. But these values must reflect actual market conditions, not aspirational pricing or theoretical calculations.

Success in this field requires more than technical competence—it demands unwavering commitment to accuracy over inflation, thoroughness over shortcuts, and integrity over expedience. As the industry matures and regulatory scrutiny increases appropriately, those appraisers who maintain the highest standards of professionalism and base their valuations on documented market research will be best positioned to serve clients while advancing the broader goals of sustainability and waste reduction.

The future of deconstruction appraisals lies not in exploiting perceived loopholes or pushing unsupportable values, but in professionally documenting the legitimate value that exists when buildings are carefully deconstructed rather than demolished. Through rigorous adherence to valuation standards, extensive market research, and honest representation of market conditions, qualified appraisers can ensure that this important environmental practice remains economically viable while maintaining absolute integrity within the tax system.

We cannot let those seeking higher values that are unsupported by the secondary retail market continue to undermine this crucial environmental incentive. The stakes are too high—for the environment, for taxpayers, and for the credibility of the profession. By maintaining professional standards and basing valuations on actual market evidence, we protect not just individual clients but the entire framework that makes deconstruction economically feasible.

In this way, proper deconstruction appraisals at accurate valuation levels represent the best of tax policy, using economic incentives to drive environmental benefits while maintaining the integrity of the tax system. This is a model worth protecting through professional excellence, and one that will only grow stronger as the secondary market continues its expansion based on real supply and demand rather than inflated expectations.

About the Authors

Jessica Irving Marschall, CPA, ISA AM
President & CEO, The Green Mission Inc.

Jessica Irving Marschall brings 26 years of experience as a practicing CPA to the deconstruction appraisal field, with the last six years dedicated to transforming how deconstructed materials are valued and understood in the marketplace. As President of The Green Mission Inc., GM-ESG, Probity Appraisal Group and MAS LLC (her tax advisory practice), she combines deep tax expertise with specialized knowledge in personal property valuation.

Jessica serves as both a fractional CFO and business management advisor, helping organizations integrate environmentally sustainable decisions with financial prudence. Her commitment to raising appraisal industry standards extends beyond her practice, she actively works with green industry leaders, appraisal standard boards, and regulatory decision-makers to ensure the integrity of the deconstruction appraisal field. Her unique combination of tax expertise, valuation knowledge, and environmental commitment has positioned her as a thought leader in creating economically viable pathways for sustainable building practices.

Jennie Lumpkin
Chief Revenue Officer, The Green Mission Inc.

Jennie Lumpkin has been instrumental in The Green Mission Inc.'s growth since its inception, recently transitioning from Director of Business Development to Chief Revenue Officer for The Green Mission Inc., as well as GM-ESG, and Probity Appraisal Group. With a background in Business Law from Washington Business School and 15 years of experience in the corporate insurance industry, she brings a unique perspective to the deconstruction appraisal business.

Over her six years with The Green Mission Inc., Jennie has become a trusted advisor to nonprofits, builders, and deconstruction contractors, known for creating streamlined workflows that navigate the complex requirements of the appraisal process. Her extensive knowledge of appraisal time constraints, nonprofit requirements, and meticulous attention to detail have made her an invaluable asset in bridging the gap between environmental mission and business execution.